

Teaching Notes

The Last Stand

by

Linda Moon Stumpff
The Evergreen State College

Learning Objectives:

1. To introduce students to the complications surrounding environmental decision-making in the tribal context including issues of sustainability, land tenure, economics and culture.
2. To understand the sovereign rights of tribes to make the best decisions to secure their homelands and preserve their culture.
3. To engage students in thinking about environmental issues using an interdisciplinary framework that incorporates environmental issues, politics, and culture.
4. To understand tribal forest management and planning in the context of changing federal policies.

Issues/Topics case includes:

1. Interdisciplinary land use issues in a tribal context
2. Forestry management and sustainable forest practices
3. Sovereignty: cultural and environmental issues
4. Policy and planning in a tribal context.

Intended Audience: This case is suitable for use in undergraduate or graduate courses in Native American and Indigenous Studies, Forestry, Environmental Studies, Public Administration, Planning and Political Science.

Update and Additional Information (9-6-16):

The Quinault Nation continues to find new ways to balance their forestry program and adapt to climate change while providing revenue streams and conserving their forests. The Nation continues to consolidate their forested land base by buying back parcels of allotted land. They developed a Climate Resilience tool-kit to address the threats of tsunami and climate change. (<https://toolkit.climate.gov-taking-action-quinault-indian->

[nation](#)) By January 2015, the Nation had experienced a seawall breach, flooding, landslides, culvert failures and the effects of invasive species that threaten critical subsistence resources. They initiated work to repair riparian habitat, replanting trees and vegetation that are important to the salmon because they lower water temperature through shade.

Under the leadership of President Fawn Sharp, they plan to enter into the international carbon credit market, which carries 10 times the internal US carbon credit market rate of value per tonnage. As a sovereign nation, they fall within the Kyoto protocol, giving them access to this international market for approximately 200,000 acres of Quinault forested lands.

In another initiative, they identified a way to deal with the burning slash piles left over from logging along the Northwest Coast. Using biofuel technology, they completed a feasibility research project on how to turn the slash piles into wood pellets for efficient heating. They are poised to open a biofuel plant that will reduce air pollution and fire danger from the smoldering slash piles. Existing slash piles can provide material for the new plant for the next 20 years. Pellets may be used by the Quinault and sold on the market.

The current status of Quinault forest management suggests questions around international carbon credits and the state of tribal sovereign status in the global arena. Alternative questions could be developed around the economics of local energy development in biofuels plus problems of measuring improvements in air quality.

Additional Resources

www.Quinault.nsn

Implementation and use: As a teacher, you are responsible for setting out a framework for understanding the basic history, context and issues presented by this case. Depending on the level of knowledge and familiarity with tribal affairs and natural resources, it may be necessary to prepare a pre-assignment and/or provide a lecture in advance so the students will have the basic knowledge to work a case set in Indian Country. A list of additional resources is provided at the end of the case that may be useful.

This case can be taught in a 50 minute class or in a longer class if time is available. One approach would be to divide the students into small groups to discuss the questions and finish the class with a general discussion period. Another approach described below has students read the case and then work in groups with maps to select areas for a timber harvest. The case can also be used to do follow-up research work.

There are several recommended options for teaching this case. The first scenario, “Thinking in the rain” forms a distinctive case and can be taught as an individual case. It

may also be taught as an interrupted case with the second scenario “Picking berries and politics.” This could be accomplished by teaching the first scenario, and then teaching the second scenario in a second class session. Another approach would be to break the class in half, with one section working on the first scenario and the other half working on the second. Either alternative using the two scenarios allows the students to see how different approaches play out in the planning process.

Finally, this case can be approached as an “opus” that includes forestry science and indigenous knowledge. This is a more advanced option and assumes that students have a basic knowledge of forestry science, indigenous knowledge, and research skills. It would work best for upper division students or in a graduate program. For this option, students would read the Quinault Forest Plan of 2003, seek additional research resources and complete a research paper analyzing this document as a forestry restoration plan. In this format, the case would be spread over several class sessions, with students working on different components in the first two or three sessions and completing research for a presentation to the class later in the term. The presentations would be followed by a general class discussion of their research findings. Students’ research could cover additional watershed, science, cultural, hydrological and forestry factors as well as the possibility for comparative studies of other forest plans. The opus option would work best with upper division or graduate students, since it requires independent research, group coordination and an advanced interdisciplinary approach using natural and social sciences.

Further Research: Depending on the amount of time allowed for this topic and the accompanying teaching case you might want students to complete one or more of the following research assignments after completing the case in class issues. You could have the students present their findings to their group, to the class, or in the form of a written paper.

1. Interview a tribal forester or environmental planner about balancing forestry practices with tribal needs.
2. Compare the Quinault land tenure scenario with that of another tribe. What similarities or differences exist? What are the impacts for economics, culture, forestry and politics?
3. Research the legislative history tribal forestry and make recommendations for pending or future legislation.
4. Research the history of forest ecology and ecosystem management as practiced by tribes.
5. Research whether tribal forestry has developed along the path of general professional forestry or is it different? Why or why not?
6. Research how the indigenous science is changing ideas about forestry.
7. Research different ways in which various nations (tribal and non-tribal) are making decisions about forest resources and brainstorm alternatives. Is this a global problem?
8. Research legislative and administrative decisions to create old growth reserves on tribal and/or public lands and contrast the results.

9. Write a short essay about tribal forest resources in a tribe other than Quinault based on your own experience and/or research. What are the similarities and/or differences?
10. Joe DeLaCruz, Quinault tribal member, long-time Tribal President, and national Indian leader was one of the founders of the self-governance era. How did this era come about? What were the legislative milestones? How has this influenced current federal Indian policy?

Teaching the Case through a Student Mapping Exercise: Selecting lands for timber harvest

The Problem

“The lands within the QIR have been the homeland of the Quinault people for thousands of years and are an integral and inseparable part of the Quinault history, culture, tradition and identity. The QIN and BIA recognize that they must provide for the future by maintaining a proper balance between use and conservation of the Quinault Reservation's natural resources. With proper vision, the QIR can be managed in an ecologically and environmentally sustainable basis that protects the heritage of the land and sustains in perpetuity the way of life of the Quinault people and other landowners.”

Quinault Forest Management Plan, 2003 p. 6)

Imagine that the Quinault Indian Nation directs its Forestry Department to prepare a timber harvest. They wish to identify about 8 parcels of land for the timber sale, so they can apply the profits from the sale to the purchase of a high-value tracts of timber land as they come up for sale. They are also asking the Forestry Department to consider some cultural concerns, especially with respect to old growth cedar for multiple uses including basketry canoes and other traditional uses. Have the students compare the four maps in the packet. They may also find the overlays useful. Have the students consider the options based on private versus tribal benefit, transportation, potential costs, and species type.

Divide the class into small groups. Each group should explain the costs and benefits of their choice, their objectives, and their strategy as to how they will accomplish the objectives. Each will group produce a marked up map of their recommendations for timber harvest and provide a presentation to the class explaining why they think their package is the best direction for the Tribe, given the statement of the Tribal Council and the need to consider cultural concerns, especially with respect to cedar. Each group of students is given a set of color overlay maps.

1. Compare the four maps in your packet. Discuss the options based on private versus tribal benefit, transportation, potential costs, species type and age. For this exercise, these factors can be used to determine which parcels show the greater economic benefit and which may have high cultural value with respect to cedar.

2. Make a decision on what acreage will be logged and mark it on the X map. Explain how your decision relates to the direction from the Tribal Council given in their “Statement of the Nation.” Mark your selections on the map with a marker. You may also mark up to eight parcels to be withdrawn from timber sales to protect old-growth cedar.
3. Locate eight parcels of land that reflect the Tribe’s need to set cultural priorities, especially old-growth cedar.
4. What are the opportunity costs of your decision? How did you prioritize your considerations?
5. How does your decision balance competing demands for benefits, and assure the sustainability of a healthy, productive forest with old growth cedar in the mix?
6. Did you include lands from the North Boundary Area? Why or why not?
7. How can economic and cultural interests both be met on a fragmented land base?

Research Question for Advanced students.

Have the students read the Quinault Forest Plan, 2003 and do additional research on the issues it raises. The students will then write a research paper which analyzes this document as a forest restoration plan. Students’ research could cover issues such as watersheds, soil, harvest succession, cultural issues, hydrological factors, tree species, wildlife and fish habitat, and other factors. Students could work individually or in groups on these papers. Their individual or small group findings would then be presented to the entire class.

Field Testing

This case has been field tested with a group of college teachers using the mapping exercise described above. They were divided into five small groups. Each group prepared a set of recommendations on what areas to log and reported out to the large group. This was a very successful approach to case which made the severity of the issues clear. This approach to the case also had the additional advantage of teaching the participants map reading skills.

Additional References and Resources

An assessment of Indian forests and forest management in the United States (2003) The second Indian Forest Management Assessment Team for the Intertribal Timber Council.

Clow, R. L. & Sutton, I. (Eds.) (2001) *Trusteeship in change: Toward tribal autonomy in resource management*. Boulder: University Press of Colorado

Ficken, R. E., (1987) *The Forested Land: A History of Lumbering in Western Washington*, Seattle: University of Washington Press.

A Forest In Trust: Three quarters of a century of Indian forestry, 1910-1986. (1986)
Missoula, MT: Historical Research Associates. Prepared for U.S., Dept of Interior, BIA,
Division of Forestry

Gordon, J., et al., (1997) An independent report on tribal forestry: Redefining the government's role. *Journal of Forestry*, 95:11, 10-14.

Hill, J. D. & H. G. Arnett, (1995) Understanding Indian Tribal Timber Sales, *Natural Resources and Environment*, 9, 38-41,67.

Moundou, D.L. (1997) Our land is what makes us who we are: Timber harvesting on tribal reservations after the NIFRMA. *American Indian Law Review* 21:2, 259-296.

Notzke, C. (1994) *Aboriginal peoples and natural resources in Canada*. North York, Ontario: Captus University Publications

Paci, C.D.J. and Krebs, L.(2004) Local knowledge as traditional ecological knowledge: definition and ownership. In B. Hosmer & C. O'Neill (Eds.) *Native Pathways: American Indian culture and economic development in the twentieth century. (pp. 261-282)*
Boulder: University Press of Colorado.

Stumpff, L. M. (2006) Reweaving earth: An Indigenous perspective on restoration planning and the National Environmental Policy Act, *Environmental Practice* 8:2, 93-103.